



**THE CIVIL SERVICE SYSTEM**  
**\_Summary report\_**

October 2017

## INTRODUCTION

The Civil Service System brings together all the procedures and practices governing the staff career advancement from recruitment to retirement. These include recruitment procedures, professional development, evaluation/promotion, mobility and remuneration.

The present report provides an overview of this system as well as an overview of the main reform initiatives undertaken in this regard since the end of the 1990s. Furthermore, it draws up a diagnosis of the system in its current form, with regard to the main aspects of the civil service. This diagnosis is refined by a focus on certain ministerial departments.

Inspired by the benchmarks of the initiatives implemented in some countries, the Audit Court of the Kingdom of Morocco (hereafter referred to as the Court) proposes areas for reforms and issues recommendations aiming at informing the public authorities on the reforms to be adopted in order to deal with the shortcomings observed.

### I. CIVIL SERVICE IN FIGURES

In 2016, the public sector consisted of approximately 860,253 employees, including 583,071 government officials, 147,637 civil servants in the local authorities and 129,545 employees of state-owned corporations.

#### 1. The State Civil Service

In addition to the imbalances in territorial deployment, the number of civil servants in government is concentrated in a limited number of departments. In budgetary terms, state staff costs are high compared to national wealth.

##### 1.1. Imbalances in the regional distribution of the workforce

Overall, the number of civil servants is not excessive when compared to the total population compared to other countries. Indeed, the rate of administration<sup>1</sup> in Morocco is 17.2 ‰ (national average). However, the territorial staff distribution is uneven across regions.

Apart from the Rabat-Salé-Kenitra region, which has a rate of administration of 27.8 ‰ mainly because of the presence of central government services in Rabat, some regions are significantly above the national average, such as the Drâa-Tafilalet with a rate of 18.3 ‰. In the extreme, the southern regions have the highest rates, with 37.7 ‰ in the Laayoune-Sakia El Hamra region and 26.7 ‰ in Dakhla-Oued Eddahab. Other regions

---

<sup>1</sup> The rate of administration is expressed as the number of officials per 1000 inhabitants.

are, however, relatively under-administered, like that of Marrakech-Safi with an administration rate of 13.5 %.

### **1.2. Concentration in a limited number of departments**

In 2016, almost 82.5% of civil servants are concentrated in four ministerial departments. The Department of National Education is the first in terms of staff with 49.4%, followed by the departments of the Interior, Health and Higher Education with 20.5%, 8.4% and 4.2% respectively.

In budgetary terms, the appropriations allocated to the payroll in 2016 amounted to more than 120 billion dirhams<sup>2</sup>. Nearly 59% of this payroll is concentrated in three departments, namely National Education, Home Affairs and Health, with 36.5%, 15.2% and 7.1% respectively. Four other departments together take up 12.7% of the total payroll (Higher Education, Justice, Economy and Finance, and Foreign Affairs). The remaining 28.6% is distributed among other ministerial departments and government institutions.

The deployment of staff deserves to be analyzed and possibly reviewed on the basis of the economic and demographic potential of each region as well as the duly assessed needs of each administrative entity.

### **1.3. High weight of payroll**

Between 2008 and 2016, total payroll increased from 75.4 to 120 billion dirhams, ie from 11.38% to 11.84% of GDP respectively. It has risen annually by 5.3% on average, compared to an average annual growth rate of 3.92% for GDP. The most significant changes in the total payroll were recorded in 2009, 2011, 2012 and 2014. This gap shows that the volume of remuneration paid to civil servants is increasing faster than GDP growth.

In comparison with other countries, the ratio of total payroll to GDP is relatively high in Morocco. In the MENA region, where staff expenditure is highest relative to GDP, this ratio is 9.8%. With an annual payroll of 11.84% of GDP in 2016, Morocco has one of the highest ratios in the region. This ratio is 7.2% in Egypt and 12.7% in Tunisia. In OECD countries, this ratio is generally below 10% (for example, it is 9.4% in France).

### **1.4. A civil service beyond the means of the country's economy**

Between 2008 and 2016, the payroll increased by 59.2% while the increase in the number of civil servants was only 9% over the same period. This sharp rise in the total

---

<sup>2</sup> The total payroll includes the gross remuneration paid to civil servants and the social security contributions of the state, as employer, to the social security schemes.

payroll is mainly due to higher pay levels, which have increased as a result of the promotion of rank and step, in addition to the various salary adjustment decisions that were often taken in response to exceptional short-term situations.

The comparison of public wage levels with other countries on the one hand and with the private sector on the other hand, makes it possible to conclude that the remuneration of civil servants is relatively high in Morocco. In the government civil service, the average net monthly salary reached 7,700 dirhams in 2016, with an evolution of 51.6% compared to 2006. The minimum net salary amounts to 3,000 dirhams, marking an evolution of 89.2% compared to 2007. These high levels are far above the private sector averages where, in 2015, the average net monthly salary reached 4,932 DH and the minimum wage was 2,568 DH.

Compared to national wealth, the average net salary in the civil service is about 3 times GDP per capita, compared with 1.2 times in France and 1 in Spain. The high level of the average wage in Morocco can be explained, of course, by the low Moroccan GDP compared to those of the above-mentioned countries, but also by the multiple wage increases decided in the framework of the labor relations.

In this respect, it is important to underline the lack of a clearly defined vision by the public authorities during the labor relations negotiations. Indeed, these negotiations are not seized by the Government to require, in return for salary increases, objectives to be assigned to beneficiaries in terms of productivity or quality of service.

The result is that Morocco offers itself a civil service that exceeds the means of its economy and that the substantial improvement of the incomes of the civil servants does not result in an improvement of the way public Administration is regarded by the citizens.

## **2. Trends and Prospects of the Government Civil Service**

### **2.1. Rigid patterns of payroll**

The projections for 2017-2021 show that the total annual payroll will continue to rise in nominal terms. Thus, based on an average growth rate similar to the last five years (3.6%), the weight of the payroll in the GDP will rise from 11.84% in 2016 to 12% in 2018, before it will decrease slightly from 2019 to 11.5% in 2021.

The validity of these projections is conditioned by a rigorous implementation of measures to control the wage bill, apart from the occurrence of exceptional social incidents resulting in massive recruitment or wage increases such as those experienced in 2011. It also depends on a growth rate of the economy above 3.5%.

## **2.2. Need for an overhaul of the remuneration system**

The rigidity of salary expenditures stems mainly from the high level of remuneration. Manpower control would, of course, mitigate the growth of these expenditures, but the impact is lessened by the effect of promotions in grades and steps which mobilize, each year, consistent budget envelopes. In 2015, this allowance reached 3.56 billion dirhams. Therefore, the control of the government wage bill of the calls, in the first place, for an overhaul of the remuneration as well as the evaluation and promotion systems.

If the number of civil servants is not excessive compared to other countries and the lowering of pay levels is difficult to implement, the levers of payroll control that could be envisaged are to limit recruitments to the bare necessities (except for departments in urgent need) and this through redeployments to alleviate imbalances in staff distribution.

## **2.3. Working time: a lever for mastering the payroll**

In view of very variable effective working hours in public administration, it is important to set up the means to ensure that the effective duration corresponds to the regulatory period.

With unchanged assignments, an increase in actual hours of work could generate an equivalent potential in man-days and alleviate the need for staff resulting from retirements to keep recruitments at a sustainable level. However, the regulatory hourly load is not achieved in a homogeneous manner and the actual duration of work in the public service remains still not well known.

While the measures introduced recently show an awareness of the trend of irregular absence of staff, these measures, which currently only concern the extreme situations of total absence, are not very effective.

For example, for the staff of the National Education, the absence extent is causing the sector to lose significant potential of its human resources. According to figures provided by the Department of Education, absences recorded in 2016, for example, had reached a total of 406,890 days. In addition, a significant proportion of teachers (90% of qualifying secondary school teachers and 74% of secondary school graduates) do not assume the hourly load allocated to them because of the mismatch between the deployment of teachers and the size of school structures.

Similarly, for the health sector, a study had shown that on average, 42% of the working time of the medical profession is not exploited because of absences.

In other public administrations, the working time, set at 37.5 hours per week, is generally not strictly observed. This results in margins for the optimization of this time.

Even for statutory working hours, its weekly hours remain, relatively, below those practiced in other countries. If the optimization of working time is a lever for the control of the wage bill, the setting up of means of control of this time would be ineffective if it is not preceded by other measures such as the generalization of management results-oriented and performance appraisal of each staff member based on clearly defined job descriptions.

#### **2.4. Demographic Structure: An Opportunity to Restructure the Civil Service**

The demographic structure of civil servants suggests that retirements are becoming increasingly important. Almost 32% of civil servants are more than 45 years of age. This situation constitutes an opportunity to initiate in-depth reforms of human resources management with a reshaping of the workforce in order to align it with the needs of tomorrow's Administration.

On the other hand, the demographic change caused by the aging of the labor force and the inadequacy of the training system with the skills needed by the Administration are all challenges that the civil service should address in the future. Only efficient training systems are able to anticipate these constraints.

### **3. The local civil servants**

With a staff of 147,637 civil servants (in 2014), the personnel of the local authorities is concentrated mainly in communes with more than 82%, followed by the prefectures and provinces which have 25,668 civil servants, or 17,4% of the workforce. As for the 12 regions, they comprise 414 officials, or 0.3% of the total workforce. Like state employees, the territorial civil service suffers from disparities in the regional distribution of the workforce and a high weight of the wage bill.

#### **3.1. Disparities in the regional distribution of the workforce**

For the territorial public service, the national average of the administration rate is 4.4 ‰. The southern regions recorded the highest rates with respectively 8.4 ‰ and 7.2 ‰ in the regions of Laayoune Sakia El Hamra and Dakhla-Oued Eddahab. On the other hand, in the regions of Draa-Tafilalt and Souss-Massa, these rates are 3.3 ‰ and 3.4 ‰ respectively.

Thus, it is necessary to note the absence of economic or demographic rationale in the distribution of the personnel of the territorial collectivities.

### **3.2. High weight of the payroll**

In terms of payroll, staff costs amounted to nearly 11.2 billion dirhams in 2016, representing 49.9% of the operating expenses of local authorities. These expenses consume the equivalent of 59.7% of their share in the VAT product. Hence the relative narrowness of the budgets of local authorities to free up more resources to cover the equipment and development needs of territories.

Between 2009 and 2015, personnel costs increased by 34.2% with an average annual growth rate of 4.29%. As a result, the payroll has changed even though the workforce has decreased (from 151,610 in 2008 to 147,637 in 2014).

This situation is due to a quasi-automatic promotion system which leads to a quasi-systematic evolution of the agents and which therefore mobilizes large amounts. It would also be due to oversized staff compared to the actual needs of local authorities. In this respect, the reports of the regional courts of accounts often conclude that the number of staff is excessive, especially at the municipal level. Recruitments within these entities do not systematically respond to real needs.

### **3.3. Impacts on the local public service**

The territorial public service does not always have qualified human resources to carry out the missions assigned to it. It is not aware of the mismatch between the human resources available and the tasks assigned to it. With a structure dominated by executing staff, the question arises as to the ability of these communities to carry out the missions that might be entrusted to them in the future.

In terms of local government structures, the absence of official organizational charts duly established and endorsed by the administrative control authorities is one of the major shortcomings of the administrative organization of the municipalities. It is often the difficulties of providing a budget to cover the indemnities of responsibility which are at the origin of the non-approval of the charts proposed by these entities.

This situation does not favor the stabilization of the structures of the administration structure of the local authorities and does not provide an adequate framework to motivate local authority executives to occupy responsibility positions.

As a result, the local public service falls short of the requirements of quality and speed of services rendered to users. Inadequacies in this area appear in particular in the quality of the reception and orientation of the users as well as in the communication with the citizens.

## **II. OVERVIEW OF INITIATIVES TAKEN BY PUBLIC AUTHORITIES**

Since the end of the 1990s, awareness of the need to reform the public administration has begun to be formalized in government guidelines. After the sound management Pact in 1998 and the Royal speech on the new concept of authority in 1999, this awareness will find its concrete expression in the 2000-2004 economic and social development plan. This plan had the merit of placing the reform of public administration and its corollary, the management of human resources, in a temporal framework. The measures were accompanied by objectives, but the achievements did not follow for lack of a governance framework to guide the reforms in a qualitative way. Thus, in the implementation of the plan, the budget preparation methods favored the setting of sectoral budget envelopes to the detriment of the economic analysis of the projects and their coherence with the objectives of the above-mentioned Plan.

During the period of the economic and social development plan (2000-2004), a national conference on "The Moroccan Administration and the challenges of 2010" was held in Rabat in 2002. This symposium proposed 162 measures to modernize the Administration, grouped into seven projects. However, the measures developed have not been translated into a clear plan of action specifying the means, objectives, timetable and follow-up procedures.

Starting in 2003, some of the measures drafted in previous initiatives will be included in the Public Administration Reform Support Program (PARAP) designed with the assistance of three donors, the African Development Bank, the World Bank and the European Union.

### **1. Program of support to the reform of Public Administration**

Since 2003, a new strategy for reforming the public administration has been introduced in a program (PARAP) spanning six years. This program includes, in addition to budget reforms, a component related to improving the effectiveness of human resources management. It spanned four phases for a total amount of 9.6 billion dirhams.

The main objectives of the component related to the improvement of the efficiency of the management of the human resources are those relating to the implementation of the measures aiming at the payroll control, the introduction of workforce planning, jobs and skills (GPEEC), administrative devolution and professional development.

#### **1.1. Measures to control the wage bill**

This is essentially the launch of the voluntary redundancy operation in 2005, in addition to the abolition of budget posts for the recruitment of executing staff and the outsourcing of maintenance and guarding tasks.



The voluntary resignation operation was intended as a start to the various projects of the administrative reform. It was mentioned that this operation would be followed by the implementation of several actions, mainly workforce planning, the development and implementation of a professional development strategy and the overhaul of the Welfare office. After more than 12 years, all these projects have not been implemented yet.

Although the voluntary redundancy operation had reduced the number of employees and the weight of the payroll, its results were not consolidated. In the absence of implementation of the accompanying measures provided for, the voluntary redundancy operation was limited to a one-off measure of lightening of the workforce, thus losing its ambition to be part of the long term measures aiming at establishing the bases of modern management of human resources.

### **1.2. staff management planning projects**

The project of generalization of the GPEEC, driven mainly by the PARAP, is present today in the programs of the majority of the ministries. However, these are isolated experiences with no overall vision, and often limited to the development of the Job and Competency Frameworks (REC). The HR function is still modeled on the traditional people management concept.

In this situation, the efficiency of the expenses incurred in this area has not been proven, since in the absence of any follow-up on the RECs, the latter will become obsolete over time and will have to be updated to take account of the changes in the missions and the organization of each administration.

The establishment of a GPEEC faces challenges related to the rigidity of the General Statute of the Civil Service (SGFP), such as the lack of consistency between employment and grade and the complexity of the remuneration system. Moreover, the multiplicity of bodies and frameworks is a constraint to the implementation of management planning and managerial flexibility.

### **1.3. Measures relating to professional development**

The PARAP provided for the adoption of a national strategy for professional development of government officials and the establishment of professional development plans relating to it by the ministerial departments. professional development needs were expected to derive from the findings of the RACs that will be developed as the departments progress. However, the achievements made in this area were mainly limited to the adoption of Decree No. 02.05.1366 of 2 December 2005 on continuing education. In addition, PARAP's various evaluation reports were limited to noting the effort made in terms of outputs, such as the adoption of texts and the volume of expenditure devoted

to professional development. No specific information are yet available on the outcomes, ie on the impact of these funds on improving the skills of human resources.

Thus, the measures announced by the 2005 decree have not been implemented yet. Professional development, which mobilizes large loans (2.44 billion dirhams between 2008 and 2016) is at total disconnection from the real needs of the administration.

#### **1.4. Measures relating to administrative devolution**

The measures relating to administrative devolution were mainly aimed at implementing decentralization master plans.

The Decree No. 02.05.1369 of 02 December 2005, on the organization of ministerial departments and administrative devolution, provides for the preparation by ministries of decentralization master plans to be submitted to the Organizational Structures Administrative Commission within one year, from the publication of the said decree. The implementation of these master plans was to take place in two to five years. These schemes should also include the skills to be transferred to the decentralized services, the number of staff in the central administrations and the decentralized services by category and grade, and the number of staff members expected to be redeployed to the decentralized services.

More than 12 years after its adoption, the measures promised remain pending implementation. Indeed, no department<sup>3</sup> has adopted its decentralization master plan. In practice, the division of powers between the central and decentralized levels remains limited to a transfer of powers at the local level, exclusively in the form of delegations of signature. The central level remains the seat of decision-making power. This shows a significant gap between the currently limited powers of the decentralized services and those which could be entrusted to them in the context of an effective devolution policy.

#### **1.5. Main lessons learned from PARP**

Overall, the key actions set out in the program components were designed with a focus on technical cross-compliance. Thus, these measures were limited to the design of tools (REC) and / or the adoption of legal texts. At the implementation level, only the measures related to the payroll control were carried out through the operation of voluntary redundancy, but without lasting effects nor overall insight.

In addition, the PARAP reforms have not focused on citizens and measures affecting the quality of services provided to the public. Thus, the provision of administrative public services to the citizen has not been improved.

---

<sup>3</sup> Except the Ministry of Culture which developed this scheme, but without it being operational.

## **2. Amendments to the General Statute of the Civil Service**

Since its adoption in 1958, the SGFP Dahir has not been significantly modified, with the exception of some limited amendments. These amendments focused on the establishment of derogations for certain categories of staff, or the detailed rules for the implementation of certain provisions of the Staff Regulations.

Although the SGFP overhaul project has been on the agenda since 2005, the government has been content with some fragmented measures instead of a comprehensive review. Some of these measures were taken late, on May 19, 2011, in the framework of the law n° 50.05 governing the generalization of application process for recruitment, mobility and contracting. The only measures taken outside these amendments are limited to the merger of certain specific statutes.

### **2.1. Delay in the implementation of contractual agreements**

In addition to the delay in adopting the implementing texts of Law 50.05, it should be noted that until July 2017, the implementation of the contractual agreements was not yet effective. In the Administration, pending the adoption of the decrees of the Head of Government setting the modalities of remuneration and the categories of personnel concerned (experts and agents) and the decree of the Minister in charge of the public service setting the conditions of the contractualization. These orders were only adopted on August 21, 2017.

This delay reflects the Administration's difficulty in regulating when it comes to innovating beyond its traditional scope. The contractualization system is also hampered by the lack of bridges between the pension schemes, which hinders the mobility of employees between the private and public sectors.

### **2.2. Insufficient measures to trigger a mobility dynamic**

Implementing Decree no. 02.13.346 governing the mobility of civil servants was only issued in 2015, more than four years after the publication of Law 50.05. In addition to this delay, the measures planned to encourage mobility do not seem to be sufficiently attractive, which may reduce the scope of this initiative. Indeed, the mobility that is the subject of the decree concerns only inter-ministerial staff, ie 24% of the civilian civil service workforce only. Moreover, the planned indemnity measures already promise to be insufficient to trigger a real mobility dynamic.

Overall, the SGFP has undergone successive amendments since 1958. However, the piecemeal approach to these amendments has created gaps and has contributed to widening disparities within the public service. Hence, the need for a global overhaul. This overhaul, which has been on the agenda since 2005 and has been in existence for more than 12 years, is still in the planning stage.

### **3. Fight against the irregular absence from work**

Although the SGFP contains provisions regarding the irregular absence of public servants, it is clear that, in practical terms, unauthorized absences from work in public administrations are not sanctioned with the due rigor.

In 2012, Head of Government Circular No.26 / 2012 recalled the provisions of the SGFP related to irregular absence during working hours and attempted to provide a set of measures to remedy the situation.

Whereas after five years of their implementation, these measures do not seem to have produced significant changes as desired, in the sense that irregular absences are not systematically identified by the Administration and when they are, the sanction is not vigorously enforced against them. This impunity shows a lack of rigor in the enforcement of legal rules in this area. It would, moreover, be likely to reinforce the bad practices of irregular absence.

In addition, it should be noted that despite the significant investments made to equip administrations with access control systems, they are underexploited and the expected impact on the citizens in terms of the availability of public servants, particularly of the Front Office remains imperceptible.

### **4. Institutional constraints to the reforms**

At the end of this review, it appears that the reforms initiated were split up into isolated measures that did not trigger a dynamic of change in the Moroccan administration. However, the interdependence of the elements of the public service system (recruitment, evaluation, advancement, training, mobility, remuneration, ...) requires an overall approach.

The lack of a comprehensive and integrated approach to reform is attributable to institutional dysfunctions, mainly the partitioning between structures, the dominant position of the Ministry of Economy and Finance, which favors budget concerns, in addition to the weight of corporatism which can hinder the different initiatives to be taken.

## **III. DIAGNOSIS OF THE CIVILSERVICE SYSTEM**

### **1. Civil service and quality of public service**

The perception of the Administration goes hand in hand with that of its staff since the civil servant is, in a way, the embodiment of the public service towards the users. In Morocco, the public service is criticized for its poor quality and unequal access.

### **1.1. Low quality of public service, despite the importance of its means**

Although the Moroccan Administration has a high level of management (65% in 2016) and consumes a high wage bill, the quality of services provided to citizens remains far from its potential. The widespread criticisms concern the system of Education, Public Health and Justice. However, these sectors account for 52.5% of the payroll, and mobilize more than 40% of the general State budget in 2016.

One of the main causes of these dysfunctions lies in the low level of mobilization of human resources. In addition, deficits in access to public services are more pronounced at the rural level and in the outskirts of major cities. The dysfunctions of public administration thus exacerbate inequalities by penalizing more vulnerable populations.

### **1.2. Lack of a culture of public services quality assessment**

Despite the dysfunctions in public services, it is clear that there is no culture of assessing their performance. Performance assessment is not an ongoing, institutionalized process. In the absence of this evaluation practice and effective control mechanism, the public service quality is not up to standard and falls short of the constitutional requirements of equal access, quality and transparency.

### **1.3. unexploited plans to simplify administrative procedures**

Although significant investments have been made in the implementation of major projects aimed at simplifying procedures and reducing the number of administrative procedures required of citizens, the impact of these projects remains imperceptible at the level of some administrations.

For example, public service users still suffers from cumbersome administrative procedures and especially the constraint of applying to several administrations for the completion of a procedure whereas the Government had launched a project of the "Gateway Government" since 2011 which aims to release the citizen from this constraint by instructing the Administration to gather all the information necessary for the completion of the requested service as soon as they exist in other administrations. Similarly, despite the presentation of a biometric national card, some administrations continue to require from the citizen a set of administrative documents such as birth certificate, certificate of residence, of citizenship, of life ...

## **2. Governance System of the State Civil Service**

The main bodies involved in taking the decisions relating to the civil service are the Ministry of Administration and Civil Service Reform and the Ministry of Economy and Finance, which have transversal competencies, in addition to the Higher Council of Public Administration. the civil service (advisory body). The other departments have

each an individual structure (often a directorate, or in some departments a division) dedicated to personnel management, responsible for implementing HRM policies at their level. The analysis of the attributions of each of these stakeholders made it possible to highlight the following observations:

### **2.1. Limited role of the Ministry of the Civil Service**

Since its creation, the Civil Service Department has experienced instability in its positioning within the government structure while frequently changing its name. The analysis of the exercise of the attributions of this Department made it possible to notice its limited power when it comes to transversal skills. These limits appear, in particular, in the management of the modernization projects of the Administration.

### **2.2. Leading role of the Ministry of Finance**

The Ministry of Economy and Finance is one of the main actors in the governance of the civil service. The Department of Budget (DB) under this Ministry participates in the development and implementation of the regulations on the status and remuneration of government employees, local authorities and some public institutions. The General Treasury of the Kingdom (TGR), meanwhile, is responsible for officials wage payment.

The weight of DB in public service decisions is considerable. Indeed, all proposals for texts with financial implications are submitted to it for examination. It is thus the center of decisions relating to the public service. In the absence of a formal exchange and consultation area between the DB and the Ministry in charge of the civil public, the treatment of the legal, financial and organizational aspects of the public service remains fragmented. This fragmentation hampers the establishment of a global policy in this area.

### **2.3. Shortcomings in the sharing of data on the Public Service**

The MEF, through the DB and the TGR, holds most of the data on human resources. However, the released data is incomplete and not easily exploitable. For example, the report on human resources accompanying the draft budget bill is limited to summary data that do not shed light on the state of the public service. The enrollment data is limited to the budget, while it is possible to describe the actual numbers available from the RGT. Payroll data are limited to gross payroll volumes without integrating credits relating to social contributions. These data also do not include remunerations and gratuities allocated to certain categories of staff on special treasure accounts.

These shortcomings do not allow for overall visibility facilitating the exercise of strategic thinking on the management of human resources.

#### **2.4. Inadequate composition of the Higher Council for the Civil Service**

The Higher Council for the Civil Service (CSFP) is an advisory body chaired by the Head of Government or by the governmental authority in charge of the civil service. Its creation has been planned since 1958 by Article 10 of the SGFP. However, it didn't come into effect until 2002.

In addition to the large number of its members (24 representatives of the public administration and 24 representatives of the officials), it struggles to meet regularly. Moreover, its composition remains limited to the sphere of public administration. However, in view of its advisory role, the presence of experts from other sectors, including the private and academic sectors, would have been of particular interest to make it a real place of consultation, exchange of experiences and debate on the major issues of the civil service.

#### **2.5. Traditional governance of HRM in ministerial departments**

The HR function in ministerial departments is often relegated to the background. This situation is reflected in a centralized management based solely on administrative procedures and the implementation of the statutes. However, performance-oriented management calls for a certain coherence between the different management processes. It also requires HRM experts, particularly in job and skills engineering, training engineering and career planning.

The traditional management style is also reflected in the HR information systems (HRIS) used in public administrations. In general, these systems are limited to the management of administrative acts. The majority of departments are lagging behind in terms of equipment for reporting and decision support solutions.

Management systems are modeled, in most organizations, on accounting requirements. Even when activity indicators exist, they are always measured from a budget perspective. However, while budget performance is essential, it is also important to consider operational performance measures.

### **3. Human Resources Management Policy in Public Administration**

#### **3.1. Recruitment procedures are open to improvement**

Over the period 2007-2016, the total number of new budget posts has reached 195,469 items for an overall annual budget of 20.72 billion dirhams, or an annual average of 2.4% of the Total payroll of government staff for this period.

In terms of performance of public services, recruitment is a determining factor since the quality of human resources assigned to an organization depends largely on the quality of its recruitment process.

Admittedly, the recruitment procedures have made progress, including the generalization of the submission of applications as a single path to access public employment and the introduction of the call for applications for management positions. However, despite the measures adopted, recruitment remains one of the weaknesses of Moroccan public administration, which, in the absence of foresight analysis of jobs and skills, cannot have medium-term vision recruitment. Added to this is the low use of modern recruitment techniques and the lack of professionalization of the structures responsible for HRM.

### **3.2. Professional development without practical goals**

Overall, in the current state, basic training does not seem to meet all the expectations of the public Administration in terms of adequate profiles. In order to overcome the weaknesses of the basic training system, lifelong learning is essential in order to improve the skills of civil servants so that they can effectively carry out their tasks.

However, continuing education activities within public administrations do not seem to fit into these objectives. This finding is illustrated by the lack of interest in training, centralized management and the lack of evaluation of the impact of professional development expenses.

### **3.3. Advancement and promotion unrelated to performance**

The conditions of advancement and promotion in the career of civil servants is one of the most complex aspects. The impartial and objective evaluation and performance assessment are key elements for the establishment of an effective HRM. They determine training, promotions and, consequently, remuneration.

Une réforme en 2006 a porté sur la rénovation du système d'évaluation et de notation des fonctionnaires. Toutefois, en dépit des mesures prises, le système de promotion et d'évaluation continue de souffrir des mêmes dysfonctionnements qu'auparavant. L'inefficacité de ce système persiste à cause du caractère quasi-systématique de la promotion et de sa déconnexion par rapport à la performance.

The reform introduced in 2006 focused mainly on the renewal of the HR performance appraisal and grading system. Nonetheless, despite the measures taken, the promotion and assessment process is still suffering from some shortcomings, as it was the case before. The ineffectiveness of this system is due to the nearly systematic nature of promotion and its disassociation from performance standards

### **3.4. Staff mobility has proved difficult to implement**

The SGFP includes a number of formulas that allow civil servants to change their situation during their administrative life and move forward while retaining the benefits



they have acquired. However, the establishment of a mobility dynamic is hampered by the persistence of certain constraints that are likely to limit the scope of the redeployment measures.

Indeed, geographical mobility comes up against the reluctance of civil servants to work outside the Kenitra-Casablanca axis and especially in remote areas. As for inter-ministerial mobility, it faces challenges linked to the remuneration system, which involves significant inequalities between administrations because of the specific bonuses for certain departments. Hence, the risk of achieving mobility solely towards the administrations which grant the most advantages and consequently the impoverishment of the others.

### **3.5. exceeded Benefits System**

Because of the multiplicity of statutes and the related allowances, the basic salary based on the index system has lost its meaning. In fact, the volume of benefits linked to the grade now represents an average of 76% share of gross monthly remuneration. This system has been further complicated by the addition of other elements of remuneration that are not provided for by any statute.

This creates unfair situations. For instance, certain categories of staff, while accomplishing the same functions, receive differentiated remuneration on the basis of the statutes alone. The inequity of the remuneration system also appears in the substantial differences between the levels of remuneration; the difference between the minimum and maximum levels is currently 1 in 21.

Overall, the current benefits system is complex, unfair and above all without any managerial purpose. Because of its weight on public funds and its close link with reform projects related to the management of human resources (evaluation and promotion, mobility, etc.), the overhaul of the remuneration system is crucial to the success of other reforms.

## **IV. FOCUS ON SOME MINISTERIAL DEPARTMENTS**

Afin d'affiner le diagnostic du système de la fonction publique, le choix a porté sur 11 départements en raison de leur importance en termes d'effectifs de leurs ressources humaines et des missions qui leur sont dévolues. Cette analyse a concerné les départements de l'Education nationale, la Santé, la Justice, l'Equipement, transport et logistique, l'Agriculture, l'Energie et mines, et le Tourisme<sup>4</sup>.

---

<sup>4</sup> Four other departments did not reply to the questionnaires of the Court of Auditors. These are the Economy and Finance, the Interior, Foreign Affairs and Higher Education.

In order to refine the diagnosis of the civil service system, the panel was comprised of 11 departments due to their importance in terms of workforce and the missions assigned to them. This analysis focused on the ministries of national education, health, justice, public works, transport and logistics, agriculture, energy and mining and tourism.

On the basis of the data provided by the departments responding to the Court's requests and the interviews held with certain human resources managers, the Court noted the main findings that characterize the management of human resources in each department. These findings can be summarized as follows:

### **1. Approximate estimate of human resources needs**

In general, administrations do not have, with few exceptions, an estimate of their actual HR needs. In addition, the rigidity of the system is such that even those ministries that have been able to assess their staffing needs have not been able to initiate the necessary redeployments to address territorial imbalances.

The approach of the RECs and the GPEEC, supposed to serve as a tool of mastering the workforce, in quantitative and qualitative terms, is currently limited carrying out studies, which in any case remain little used. In practice, the management of human resources remains essentially administrative and the needs in human resources are determined as a rough approximation.

### **2. Evaluation system disconnected from its purpose**

The evaluation system remains disconnected from its purpose and does not allow to measure the performance of each official or to distinguish the profiles on this basis. Indeed, the results of evaluations are systematically pushed towards the highest levels of the grading because of the absence of relevant assessment criteria and objectives and the lack of rigor that marks the process.

In the absence of an objective evaluation mechanism, the remuneration system remains tied almost exclusively to seniority. In addition to the statutory system, some departments use the distribution of bonuses in the form of travel allowances. Designed in the margins of regularity, to serve as a motivation for certain categories of staff, these "additional remuneration" have become assets unrelated to their set purpose.

### **3. Payroll growth despite stagnation in headcount**

Overall, it was noted that staff costs are constantly changing as the workforce moves towards stabilization. This divergence is due to increasingly high pay levels due to wage increases decided in the framework of the labor relations, and because of the budgetary impact of the progress of grade and step which has become almost systematic.

#### **4. Absence of reliable data on actual working time**

Although compensation levels are continuously increasing, the Administration does not yet have reliable data on the performance of the civil servants' regulatory workload. As such, effective work schedules remain largely unknown in most organizations. This is a deficiency in the civil service system, which means that the existing potential in terms of human resources remains under optimized as a whole. This shortcoming calls for urgent measures to remedy this situation. Otherwise, efforts to better size the workforce would be unproductive.

The effectiveness of staffing performance must be questioned before planning for future recruitments, since recruitment is not an end in itself. It must be conceived as an investment whose sole purpose is to properly serve the public service user.

### **RECOMMENDATIONS AND REFORM TRACKS**

The public administration must always keep in view its main purpose: to serve the citizen.

The strategist State cannot succeed in achieving its development objectives without the support of an Administration capable of carrying out and assisting with the Kingdom's economic and social development strategies. This is an Administration inherently upgraded and different from the traditional administration. It must be an efficient, skilled, effective, innovative and responsive administration.

The public service reform, like other structural reforms and which often interferes with certain category interests, could not be limited to technical adjustments. It inevitably involves deep-rooted actions that cannot succeed without a strong political commitment from the Government and a responsible involvement of the officials and organizations that represent them for the benefit of the nation and its citizens.

Following the observations and conclusions set out in this report, the Court proposes the following avenues for reform:

#### **1. Rehabilitate the civil service value system**

Faced with the important challenges of the economic and social development of our country, the culture of public administration must imperatively evolve to be part of the management by objectives and results rationale.

To do so, the Court recommends:

- To undertake profound actions to rehabilitate the system of values, within the public administration, by highlighting the honor of serving the citizen, patriotism, rigor, quality, integrity and commitment to the general interest;

- To introduce rigorous measures to combat bad practices such as absenteeism, procrastination or excessive delays in handling citizens 'and investors' files. Best practices and model behaviors should be recognized and encouraged.

## **2. Establish mechanisms to improve the quality of public services**

The periodically carried out assessments of the public service quality would make it possible to make permanent improvements provided that, in parallel, sanctioning measures are put in place. As such, the Court makes the following recommendations:

- institutionalize, in each Administration, a practice of periodic evaluation of the public service quality, including user satisfaction measures, and to improve the quality and conditions of public service provision in the light of these evaluations;
- set up mechanisms for the accountability of administrations and agents regarding users complaints;
- adopt codes of good practice for civil servants within public administrations and ensure their publication and enforcement.

## **3. Require administrations to comply with measures to simplify procedures**

In order to make progress in simplifying procedures, the Court recommends the following:

- To better take advantage of major projects (eg the biometric card) or those unachieved. As such, it is important to constantly review processes by simplifying procedures and minimizing the number of documents required by the Administration;
- To strengthen the efforts for the operation of the "Government Gateway" project and agree on a deadline to reach the objective of reducing the number of administrative procedures, in particular the obligation for the Administration in charge of an administrative procedure to apply itself to the other administrations to obtain the documents or the data necessary for the accomplishment of the said procedure;
- To avoid the overlap of the double channels (conventional and digital) and set ambitious deadlines to switch to the digital whole. In the meantime, technically mature digital services should become the rule and not the exception as it has been the case so far.

## **4. Master the working time in public administration**

The mastery of working time is essential to making good use of it, as a leverage to optimize the existing potential of human resources and thus control the payroll,

particularly in a context of declining budgets. Thus, it is important to restore rigor while respecting administrative time by implementing the following recommendations:

- Put an end to the absence of civil servants impunity by ensuring the strict application of the provisions of the PFMS in this area;
- Generalize the access control systems in the various administrations in order to control the attendance time of the civil servants, and to ensure the application of the sanctions provided by the law with regard to any unjustified non-attendance by deductions on wages, in application of the principle of remuneration in return for work;
- Ensure the exploitation of the data generated by the access control systems. This operation should be done at the level of each department, but also centralized at the level of the Ministry in charge of the civil service so that these data are analyzed and regularly made available to the public;
- Think about the introduction, for the functions that do not require a regular presence within the offices of the administrations, of procedures that allow remote, or part-time work, while ensuring a personalized follow-up of the performance and the results of each official.

## **5. Review the governance of public service reforms**

In designing and implementing a reform of the public service system, the Court recommends to take the following measures:

- Design and implement a comprehensive strategy for reform of the civil service system, duly broken down into specific actions with prioritized objectives, reflected time horizons, taking into account the estimated budgetary impact and identifying the persons responsible for each action;
- in the event that the Government chooses to entrust this project to the Ministry of the Civil Service, its mandate should be strengthened to invest arbitration missions between the various entities;
- Ensure that the Ministry in charge of the civil service, through its cross-cutting agendas, takes full advantage of its attachment to the Head of Government, avoiding to be content to act as a sectoral department;
- Set up a computerized, unified, comprehensive and up-to-date database of public administration staff. This database must be accessible, with the necessary authorizations, to all the actors concerned by the reform;
- Generalize the computerization of State and Territorial public administrations by ensuring the establishment of integrated information systems allowing the interoperability and fluid exchange of data between the different systems.

## **6. To initiate an effective policy of administrative devolution**

In order to put in place the prerequisites for effective decentralization, the Court makes the following recommendations:

- Speed up, in the first place, the devolution of decision-making powers relating to the everyday acts on the management of human resources at the level of all public administrations;
- Provide the decentralized departments with the necessary human resources consequently to precisely stating their tasks. To this end, differentiated incentive mechanisms should be provided to make these decentralized departments more attractive.

## **7. Professionalize the recruitment for Public Administration**

It is important to modernize recruitment by drawing on proven HRM techniques in the private sector and in other countries. Pending a recasting of the General Civil Service Statute (SGFP), the Court recommends the public authorities to:

- Continue the effort to reduce the number of statutes by limiting the purpose of the special statutes strictly to the provisions that derogate from the SGFP;
- Work towards the professionalization of recruitment, in particular by reducing the weighting of academic conditions in favor of other considerations related to know-how and skills, necessary in relation to the target position;
- Develop the necessary prerequisites for the success of the recruitment policy by contract, in particular through the gradual introduction of the necessary elements of the "employment system" such as job description and the definition of profiles;
- Break compartmentalization between the public and private sectors, through the recognition, during recruitment, of professional experiences in both sectors, and the establishment of bridges between the public and private pension systems.

## **8. To increase awareness of evaluation and link promotion and merit**

The reform should pursue the objective of breaking with almost automatic promotion and setting incentives to civil servants to discharge their duties with the required rigor and good conduct. This reform should incite them to perfect their know-how according to the requirements of the service. Thus, for the redesign of the evaluation and promotion system, it is recommended to:

- Set up, at the level of each Administration, evaluation benchmarks that would make it possible to measure the performance of each official on the basis of the tasks assigned to him/her;

- break with the almost automatic promotion and incite the civil servants to take initiatives and be innovative and to improve their know-how during their career by associating, with the system of promotion and advancement, a system sanction in which the worst performers could regress;
- Establish procedures to ensure that exceptional performance can lead to tailored and individualized promotion, such as the ability of high performing agents to be paid exceptionally at a higher level.

### **9. Undertake a global overhaul of the remuneration system**

In view of an overall overhaul of the remuneration system, it would be useful to overcome the main shortcomings through the implementation of the following recommendations:

- Review the remuneration system particularly by making the most of the studies already carried out in this area;
- Revise the composition of the remuneration system in order to re-establish the importance of the basic salary and to reduce the weight of allowances to correspond to their set objective;
- Ensure that there is consistency, in the reforms to be introduced, between the remuneration system and the evaluation and promotion system;
- Avoid, when performance-related remuneration is considered, the risk of its evolution towards a permanent and generalized asset.

### **10. Enhance staff mobility**

In order to trigger a dynamic of resettling of human resources between the central and decentralized services, on the one hand, and between the various departments on the other hand, the Court makes the following recommendations:

- Implement resettling operations with sufficiently attractive incentive measures to ensure their success in order to offset imbalances in the distribution of staff;
- Reduce the pay gap between the different levels of government, and to differentiate between pay and promotion criteria, taking into account the workplace;
- Link promotion to mobility to encourage agents to change their duty stations.

### **11. Give meaning to professional development**

In order to become more relevant and attractive, professional development for civil servants should be closely linked to evaluation and promotion processes. To do this, it is recommended to:

- Elaborate a professional development policy with specific objectives and linked to the evaluation and promotion system;
- Ensure the pooling of efforts and resources committed to professional development throughout the public administration;
- Ensure the design of professional development programs according to duly defined needs and in consultation with the various stakeholders;
- Regularly assess the impact of professional development programs on the staff member and the quality of their work;
- Give professional development its full meaning by integrating it into career advancement criteria;
- For professional development to become attractive, place the official at the heart of the process by giving him the opportunity to choose the training that corresponds to his ambitions in terms of career and that would allow him to progress.

## **12. Restructuring the territorial civil service workforce**

Local and regional authorities have a mismatch between the human resources available to them and the missions they assume or are expected to assume in the context of advanced regionalization. It is therefore important to consider measures to resize these resources, to correspond to the needs of the local public service. These measures should have a twofold objective: to correct imbalances in the distribution of personnel and to reduce the weight of the wage bill on the local authorities budgets. In order to achieve this, the Court recommends that local and regional authorities and administrative supervision authorities:

- Act, initially, for a better redeployment of overstaffing while moving towards a process tending to improve the quality and the frequency of supervision;
- Facilitate the redeployment of staff between territorial communities and between the latter and the State administrations and ensure that the territorial public service becomes more attractive;
- Design and implement a reform of the territorial public service with the aim of resizing it in terms of numbers and profiles;
- Specify, at the level of each community, the tasks to be performed by each staff member and thus define the optimal size of the staff;
- Carry out a management planning of human resources according to current and future skills needs in correlation with the local authorities' projects and the imperatives of improving the quality of services rendered.



### **13. Gear the territorial civil service to providing a better service to users**

Regional and local authorities, as it is a community administration, play an important role in the provision of services on a day-to-day basis. They are also a determining factor in shaping the image of the public administration as perceived by the users.

As such, it is imperative to pay special attention to the organization of the local administration, the quality of the services rendered, the reception, the swiftness of files processing, the user counseling, transparency and simplification of procedures and ethical behavior. To do this, it is recommended to:

- Provide regional and local administration with organizational charts adapted to their management needs, with a precise description of the tasks and responsibilities of each administrative unit and those of the persons in charge of their management;
- build the professional and human resources management capacities through targeted training actions;
- Put in place innovative mechanisms to motivate highly qualified executives to assume responsibilities within the territorial civil service.